

HARROGATE BOROUGH COUNCIL

PLANNING AREA2 DC COMMITTEE – AGENDA ITEM 6: LIST OF PLANS.

DATE: 3 August 2004

PLAN: 02	CASE NUMBER: 04/03307/FUL
APPLICATION NO. 6.78.47.I.FUL	GRID REF: EAST 438295 NORTH 461100
	DATE MADE VALID: 25.06.2004
	TARGET DATE: 20.08.2004
	WARD: Claro

APPLICANT: Mr R Bailey

AGENT: A Sharpe Associates

PROPOSAL: Erection of 1 no replacement detached dwelling (revised scheme, site area 0.084ha).

LOCATION: Hazel Head Farm Arkendale Knaresborough North Yorkshire HG5 0RG

REPORT

SITE AND PROPOSAL

Hazel Head farm lies on the edge of the village of Arkendale. The application site comprises an old dilapidated farmhouse and an area of land to the east of the existing house, the site is located immediately to the north of an area of common land known as The Mar. The site is accessed by Moor Lane, passing the Mar, and there is also a vehicular access to the farm from West Field Lane. The farm is comprised of a range of buildings including an agricultural workers dwelling approved in 1994, and two agricultural buildings which have recently gained planning permission for conversion to holiday lets, there is no longer any farming activity.

The application proposes the demolition of the old farmhouse and its replacement with a new 5 bedroom dwelling and parking area to accommodate two vehicle spaces. The scheme represents a revised development following the withdrawal of application under 6.78.47.H.FUL. The dwelling will be constructed of stone/cobble under a slate roof. The proposed garden area will be marked by hedgerow/cobble wall and 3 rail timber fence.

MAIN ISSUES

1. Land Use
2. Visual Amenity
3. Residential Amenity
4. Highway Safety
5. Open Space Provision

RELEVANT SITE HISTORY

6.78.47.PA - Erecting new farmhouse: Refused 01.06.1990

6.78.47.A.OA - Outline application : Erection of a new agricultural workers dwelling:
Refused 21.06.1994

6.78.47.B.OA - Construction of agricultural workers dwelling: Approved 06.12.1994

6.78.47.D.REM - Erection of 1 No agricultural workers dwelling: Approved 14.05.1996

6.78.47.E.FUL - Erection of a pig unit with boar pen and feed store: Approved 17.05.1999

6.78.47.F.FUL - Erection of extension to general purpose agricultural building: Refused
20.03.2000

6.78.47.G.FUL - Conversion of disused Sow House to form 1 No holiday cottage and
conversion of disused granary to form 1 No holiday flat: Approved 30.06.2003

6.78.47.H.FUL - Erection of 1 No. replacement dwelling, including integral garage (site
Area 0.13 hectares). WITHDRAWN 15.08.2003.

CONSULTATIONS/NOTIFICATIONS

Parish Council

Arkendale

Highway Authority

No objection subject to the imposition of conditions.

APPLICATION PUBLICITY

SITE NOTICE EXPIRY: 30.07.2004

PRESS NOTICE EXPIRY: 30.07.2004

REPRESENTATIONS

ARKENDALE PARISH COUNCIL - At the time of writing this report no comments have
been received.

OTHER REPRESENTATIONS At the time of writing this report no other representations
have been received.

VOLUNTARY NEIGHBOUR NOTIFICATION - No properties notified.

RELEVANT PLANNING POLICY

PPG1 Planning Policy Guidance 1: General Policy and Principles

PPG3 Housing

PPG7 The Countryside: Environmental Quality and Economic and Social Development

- PPG17 Planning Policy Guidance 17: Planning for open space, sport and recreation
- LPHX Harrogate District Local Plan (2001, as altered 2004) Policy HX: Managed Housing Site Release
- LPH06 Harrogate District Local Plan (2001, as altered 2004) Policy H6: Housing developments in the main settlements and villages
- LPH07 Harrogate District Local Plan (2001, as altered 2004) Policy H7: Housing development in the countryside
- LPH05 Harrogate District Local Plan (2001, as altered 2004) Policy H5: Affordable Housing
- LPH20 Harrogate District Local Plan (2001, as altered 2004) Policy H20: Replacement Dwellings in the Countryside
- LPHD20 Harrogate District Local Plan (2001, as altered 2004) Policy HD20: Design of New Development and Redevelopment
- LPA01 Harrogate District Local Plan (2001, as altered 2004) Policy A1: Impact on the Environment and Amenity
- SPH5 North Yorkshire County Structure Plan Policy H5
- LPC15 Harrogate District Local Plan (2001, as altered 2004) Policy C15: Conservation of Rural Areas not in Green Belt
- SPE2 North Yorkshire County Structure Plan Policy E2

ASSESSMENT OF MAIN ISSUES

1. LAND USE - The site lies outside of the built up confines of the village of Arkendale. The relevant policy concerning the replacement dwellings within the countryside is Policy H20 of the adopted Harrogate District Local Plan. Policy H20 is permissive of replacement dwellings where a range of criteria are met. The proposal does meet a number of these criteria, ie the new dwelling is located on the site of or close to the existing dwelling to be cleared, the new dwelling is sited to preclude the retention of the existing dwelling, and the existing dwelling is not a listed building.

Policy H20 does however identify that the replacement dwelling should be no larger than the existing dwelling. This is to ensure that the existing landscape is protected. The replacement dwelling is significantly larger (albeit reduced in size to the scheme submitted under 6.78.47.H.FUL). The existing dwelling occupies a footprint of 14m x 7m (with a single storey side extension of 3m x 4.2m) , whilst the proposed dwelling is of dimensions 16.9m x 9.3m resulting in an increased footprint of 110square metres to 157 square metres. In addition the overall height will be increased by 2.2m. The dwelling therefore fails to comply with HDLP Policy H20.

HDLP selective Alteration policy HX is permissive towards replacement dwellings. The site area is greater than 0.1 hectares in area and as such HDLP Selective Alteration Policy H5 is applicable. Given that the scheme represents the replacement of an existing structure the requirement to provide 50% affordable provision cannot be justified in this instance.

2. VISUAL IMPACT - The existing farmhouse is of two storey construction and modest in scale. The building is built into the hillside, with a high retaining wall to the rear of the property. The dwelling is located in a particularly prominent and sensitive location overlooking the Mar.

Policy H20 seeks to ensure that in order to protect the existing landscape , replacement dwellings are of a similar or smaller size to the original. The proposed dwelling is

considered to be significantly larger than that to be replaced. Whilst it is accepted that the existing dwelling is particularly low lying for a two storey unit, the increased height, size and mass of the proposed dwelling would dominate the existing group of buildings and detract from the setting of the Mar itself. Although the design of the dwelling has been simplified from that submitted under 6.78.47.H.FUL, it is considered that overall and given the sensitivity of the site the proposal would be contrary to Policies HD20 and A1 of the adopted Harrogate District Local Plan.

3. RESIDENTIAL AMENITY - It is considered that the proposal would not have serious impact on the residential amenity of nearby residents, and the accommodation would provide sufficient residential amenity for future residents.

4. HIGHWAY SAFETY - The access is proposed from the existing track which leads from Moor lane to the Farm. No garaging is proposed as part of this scheme, although a parking area is indicated to the west of the dwelling. It would not be unreasonable to expect a dwelling of the size proposed (5 bedrooms) to provide garage accommodation. Such provision would clearly have implications in respect of HDLP Policy HD20. No such provision forms part of this scheme. The highway authority have been consulted and have no objection to the development subject to the imposition of conditions.

5. OPEN SPACE PROVISION - Under the provisions of HDLP Policy R4 a commuted sum is not required in this instance as the development represents a replacement dwelling.

CONCLUSION - The broad land use principle of the replacement dwelling is considered acceptable under the provisions of HDLP Policy H20 and HDLP Selective Alteration Policy HX.

The site is however located in a prominent and sensitive location. The replacement dwelling is considered to be significantly larger than the original. Although the design of the dwelling has been improved to that submitted as part of 6.78.47.H.FUL the overall size and scale of the unit would still in the opinion of your officer detract from the visual amenity of the Mar. The application is contrary to the provisions of the adopted Local Plan Policies and in the absence of any material circumstances to set aside the development plan refusal of the application is recommended.

CASE OFFICER: Mr A Hough

RECOMMENDATION

That the application be REFUSED. Reason(s) for refusal:-

- 1 The proposed dwelling as a consequence of its size and mass would be significantly larger than the existing dwelling and would as a consequence dominate the existing group of buildings in a manner that would detract from the visual amenity of the locality. The development would as a consequence be contrary to the provisions of Harrogate district Local Plan Policy H20 and A1.

